

Collaboration Of Stakeholders In The Development Of Halal Tourism In Malang City Of East Java Indonesia In Technology Era 4.0

Sri Umiyati¹, M. Husni Tamrin^{2*}.

Universitas Hang Tuah Surabaya

Email: sri.umiya@hangtuah.ac.id¹, m.husnitamrin@hangtuah.ac.id²

ABSTRACT

As a form of exploration on the potential for halal tourism many countries, both Muslim and non-Muslim, have begun to provide products, facilities and infrastructure to meet the needs of Muslim tourists. This study aims to analyze the role and collaboration of stakeholders in the development of halal tourism in Malang. The research method used is qualitative, with data collection techniques carried out by direct observation, interviews, and documentation. The results showed that the role of stakeholders in the development of halal tourism in Malang City, which is divided into key stakeholders, primary stakeholders and secondary stakeholders (supporters). Stakeholder collaboration in the development of halal tourism is carried out administratively, increasing commitment, increasing mutuality, increasing understanding and shared goals, increasing trust, enhancing good communication collaboration and collaborative environments consisting of work environments and leadership styles. While the supporting and inhibiting factors in the development of halal tourism in Malang are internal and external factors.

Keywords: Collaboration, Stakeholders, Tourism, Halal Tourism.

Correspondence:

Sri Umiyati
Universitas Hang Tuah Surabaya

*Corresponding author: sri.umiya@hangtuah.ac.id

INTRODUCTION

Halal industry has become a global trend in the recent years. This is proven with the release of a survey on the potential of halal industry by Thomson Reuters and Dinar Standard. It is stated that in 2013, the growth of assets in halal industry reached US\$ 1.6 dollars. With the presence of such magnificent growth due to the high demand of halal needs, in 2019 there was a significant growth with the total consumption by consumers reaching US\$ 3.7 trillion dollars. Knowledge and awareness on halal products have made the growth of halal industry to keep increasing (Hamdan, 2013). With the increase of halal industry, it has incurred the potential of halal tourism as a new phenomenon (Samori, 2016).

The interest to halal tourism has experienced an increase in its growth (Battour and Ismail, 2016). Muslim tourists are estimated to increase as much as 30% in 2020 as well as an increase of output value as much as US\$ 200 billion dollars (Master Card and Crescent Rating, 2016). As a form of exploration on the potential of halal tourism, there are countries; both Muslim and non-Muslim that have started to provide products, facilities, as well as infrastructures to fulfil the needs of Muslim tourists. However, there are still businesspeople or parties involved in the sector of tourism having trouble with the understanding of products, facilities, as well as infrastructures from halal tourism (El-Gohary, 2016).

Related to the presence of interest which increases on halal tourism, it is responded by the government of Indonesia by giving efforts to realize and make Indonesia as the global halal hub. This is supported by the presence of potential possessed by Indonesia with tropical climate making Indonesia to have diversity in flora and fauna, as well as biodiversity that have made Indonesia to possess potential as a tourism destination country. In addition, Indonesia has also possessed the largest Muslim population in the world with the percentage of 75% thus making the demands for halal products also larger. Tourism products are grouped into natural tourism,

cultural tourism, and man-made tourism (Widagdiyo, 2015).

In East Java, precisely in Malang City, the Mayor Drs. Sutiaji by the end of 2018 in its work program planned that Malang City to become a halal tourism destination dengan mengangkat konsep Halal, Aman dan Sehat (HAS). The enthusiasm of entrepreneurs to realize halal destinations needs to be appreciated because entrepreneurs in the hotel, restaurant and entertainment areas in Malang have been registered to apply for halal certification.

The development of halal tourism (halal tourism) will be realized by the role of stakeholders both the city government, universities, the MSME sector and the active role of the community. Various efforts made by the City Government in increasing halal awareness for the community. Among these efforts include: holding a halal culinary bazaar, seminars and technical guidance for the preparation of halal certificate applications for MSME, designating 5 places to serve as halal pilot projects. With the collaboration of stakeholders it can make halal tourism in Malang City to grow.

METHOD

Research Place

The research conducted is located in Malang, East Java. Determination of the location of this study was carried out because Malang Raya is included in the leading halal tourist destination of the Indonesia Muslim Travel Index (IMTI) 2019. Malang had its own attraction for tourists both domestic and foreign tourists.

Method

The type of research in this writing is descriptive qualitative research, where the nature of qualitative research aims to examine human life in cases that are limited in nature, but in depth and holistic, in the sense of not knowing the selection of symptoms conceptually to

its exclusive aspects that we are familiar with variables (Soetandyo, 1997). Qualitative research not only reveals real events, but can also reveal hidden values. In addition, qualitative research is also more sensitive to descriptive information, and relatively tries to maintain the integrity of the object under study. This qualitative research (Miles, 2007) is not intended to solve problems or test theories but to build and articulate accumulative understandings in the context of this research is the Collaboration of Stakeholders in the Development of Halal Tourism in Malang City. Sources of data used in this study were sourced from primary data and secondary data. The informants in this study are: Mayor of Malang, Head of Disbudpar of Malang City, Secretary General of the Indonesian Halal Travel Association (ATHIN), Chairperson of the Association of Indonesian Restaurant Hotels (PHRI) Malang, LPPOM MUI and Tourism Visitors.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The Development of Halal Tourism in the Perspective of Law Number 33 Year 2014 concerning Halal Product Guarantee and RI Law No. 8 of 1999 concerning Consumer Protection

The birth of a legal product certainly has a goal that will be achieved for the public interest in general. Without exception the birth of the law on halal product guarantee (JPH). The law was created to regulate human behavior so that life is put orderly and safe in relations between one human being with another, between one community and another. And so on. However, the most important thing about the birth of the law is the guarantee of legal certainty for the community. That is, if legal certainty is guaranteed, then the legal subjects will feel safe, secure, calm, and comfortable to carry out legal actions in relation to tourism activities, because they are free from doubts about the threat of punishment that will be received. Therefore, in Article 3, it is emphasized that the implementation of JPH aims:

- a. Provide comfort, security, safety and certainty of the availability of Halal Products for the public in consuming and using products;
- b. increase added value for Business Actors to produce and sell Halal Products.

In the world of tourism such products are definitely needed by Muslim tourists, especially for food and drinks as their primary needs. Both are served in the hotel where they stay and in the restaurants available. Furthermore what is meant by the increase in added value in letter b is economic added value because consumers (product users) feel there is legal protection. Thus the presence of the JPH legislation will benefit not only producers, but also consumers. That is, in the world of tourism, the existence of this legislation not only benefits the stakeholders, but also for Muslim tourists in protecting their beliefs. This is the true goal to be achieved by the presence of a law on JPH which basically is to protect the Muslim community from avoiding anything that is counterproductive to the principles of Sharia. Likewise, the activities in the world of tourism are predicated as halal.

Meanwhile, in RI Law No. 8 of 1999 concerning Consumer Protection. According to Article 2 of this law that, "consumer protection is based on benefits, fairness, balance, security and consumer safety, and legal

certainty." Legal certainty here is intended juridical protection for the consumers not receiving the desired targets, or in this case Muslim tourists in halal tourism. Say if there are inconveniences experienced by tourists in tourist attractions, then the perpetrators of tourism can be claimed according to the provisions of applicable law. Perpetrators unilaterally cannot release this responsibility because tourist rights have been legally guaranteed.

For this reason, Article 3 states that consumer protection is aimed at:

- a. increase awareness, ability and independence of consumers to protect themselves;
- b. increasing the dignity of consumers by avoiding negative excesses in the use of goods and / or services;
- c. increase consumer empowerment in choosing, determining and claiming their rights as consumers;
- d. creating a consumer protection system that contains elements of legal certainty and information disclosure and access to information;
- e. fostering awareness of businesses about the importance of consumer protection thus would grow honest and responsible attitudes in the business ;
- f. improve the quality of goods and / or services that guarantee the continuity of the business of producing goods and / or services, health, comfort, security, and consumer safety. The contents of this article basically want to emphasize that the interests of consumers in many respects must be absolutely guaranteed. The intended interest is the right that needs to be granted by the entrepreneur. If not, the rights of consumers will feel threatened thus the comfort and satisfaction in conducting tours will no longer be as expected.

This is actually what is meant by the provisions of letter e in this Article 3 which states to foster awareness of business actors regarding the importance of consumer protection so as to grow honest and responsible attitudes in doing business. This means that halal tourism industry businesses should realize that protection is an obligation that must be fulfilled.

Development of Halal Tourism in Malang City

The development of halal tourism in Malang began in April 2016 marked by an MOU between the Indonesian Ministry of Tourism and Malang City Government and the Chancellor Forum represented by the Chancellor of Brawijaya University, which made a joint agreement on the development of halal tourism through the preparation of amenities and destinations and Human Resources in the field of tourism, local government policies, and assistance by universities.

The implementation of the halal tourism MOU is in the form of the preparation of halal tourism DSRA (Design of Action Plan Strategies). Mayor Drs. Sutiaji at the end of 2018 in the vision and mission of the work program announced there is a future of Malang which contains

Malang Halal. So it needs to be strengthened by the implementation of DSRA halal tourism which has been prepared since 2017 by the Government of Malang City, business people, and halal centers such as Brawijaya University, State Islamic University, UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim, Malang University, and Muhammadiyah University Malang.

One form of DSRA implementation is in the form of strengthening human resources towards halal provisions and halal legality certification for hotel kitchens and restaurants in order to provide certainty of halal products in tourist services, especially with the demand for foreign tourists from Singapore, Thailand and Malaysia that require halal certainty in terms of food and beverage consumption in hotels and restaurants.

In line with this matter, based on Law 33 of 2014 and PP 31 of 2019 that since October 17, 2019 is a mandatory halal limit for hotel and restaurant food products. Then Disbudpar facilitates halal certificates for hotel kitchens and restaurants in the city of Malang. Besides Disbudpar together with 5 (five) halal centres from UB, UM, UMM, UNISMA, and UIN in collaboration with LPPOM MUI and TP3H (Team for the Acceleration of Halal Tourism Development) Ministry of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia by organizing the SJH Guidance (Halal Assurance System) with the principle of HAS (Halal Safe Healthy).

The Purpose of Development of Halal Tourism in Malang City

The development of halal tourism will be realized by the role of stakeholders both the city government, universities, the MSME sector and the active role of the community. Various efforts made by the City Government in increasing halal awareness for the community. Among these efforts include: holding a halal culinary bazaar, seminars and technical guidance for the preparation of halal certificate applications for MSME, designating 5 places to serve as halal pilot projects. With the collaboration of stakeholders it can make halal tourism in the city of Malang to grow. The implementation of halal tourism bazaar aims to strengthen Malang City to become a leading halal tourist destination. Halal tourism bazaar that has been held has guaranteed the halal products not only in the food but also in the process that will be sold to consumers.

A. Stakeholder analysis in the Development of Halal Tourism in Malang

I. The role of stakeholders in the development of halal tourism in Malang City

The development of halal tourism in Malang City is separated from 3 (three) stakeholder roles, namely key stakeholders, supporting stakeholders (secondary) and primary stakeholders. Key stakeholders are stakeholders who have legal authority in decision making. The key stakeholders in question are the executive element according to their level, the legislature and the agency. Key decision-making stakeholders for a district level project. Some are included in the key stakeholders, the Mayor and the Head of Disbudpar. The city government, namely the Mayor of Malang and the head of Malang City Disbudpar as the key stakeholder in charge of developing halal tourism in the city of Malang, has a high level of importance and high influence. Aside from being a key

stakeholder, the City Government of Malang also acts as a coordinator who seeks to develop halal tourism in Malang. The development includes holding a Malang culinary bazaar in Malang City Hall, Seminar and technical guidance for preparing halal certification requests for MSME to increase awareness of halal certification at the Halal Center located in 5 (five) Universities in Malang, and Designation of 5 places used as a Halal Pilot Project. In addition, the Malang City government also acts as a catalyst, namely the city government must take into account all the factors that influence the development of halal tourism. Controlling negative factors that tend to be inhibitors thus the impact can be minimized, and can recognize factors that are driving the pace of development of halal tourism so as to be able to attract great benefits. Then the City Government of Malang also acts as a dynamicator. In this indicator the Government of Malang City as the coordinator gives directions to the stakeholders concerned with the development of halal tourism in the City of Malang.

Supporting (secondary) stakeholders are stakeholders who do not have a direct interest link to a policy, program and project, but have concerns thus they also speak out and influence community attitudes and legal decisions of government. Some of the included (secondary) supporting stakeholders in this study are: LPPOM MUI (Institute for Food, Medicine, and Cosmetics Study of the Indonesian Ulema Council), University of Brawijaya, UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim, State Islamic University, State University of Malang, and Muhammadiyah University of Malang and the MSME Sector. Supporting (secondary) stakeholders have a high influence on the development of halal tourism in Malang and lower interests when compared to key stakeholders. In addition, stakeholders from the Higher Education Institution and LPPOM MUI also acted as facilitators, who carried out their physical roles in the form of facilities and infrastructure providers and halal certification. While from the MSME sector, it acts as an implementator trying to contribute in every activity organized by stakeholders who act as coordinators, such as participating in halal culinary bazaar events in Malang City Hall then taking part in seminars and technical guidance for preparing halal certification requests for MSME at the Halal Center which is located in 5 (five) Higher Education Institutions in Malang.

The main stakeholders are stakeholders who have a direct interest relationship with a policy, program, and project. They must be placed as the main determinant in the decision making process. In this study the main stakeholders are the public / tourist visitors. The main stakeholders, namely the community or tourist visitors who support the development of halal tourism in the city of Malang have a high level of importance and low influence. The community or tourist visitors also act as executors, by contributing in attending activities that have been held by the Malang City Government.

II. Stakeholder Collaboration in the Development of Halal Tourism in Malang

Collaboration is an effort made by various parties to achieve a common goal. According to Harley and Blismas (2010) collaboration is an effort to unite various parties to achieve the same goal. Collaboration requires a variety

of parties both individuals and organizations, working together to achieve a common goal.

In collaboration there are components that are the key to success. These components complement each other, so collaboration will succeed if it meets all the components. Thomson and Perry (2006) explained that the main components of collaboration are transmutation goals, permanent and voluntary membership, organizations, interactive processes, and temporary properties.

In this research, the development of halal tourism in the city of Malang requires the collaboration of each stakeholder. The key stakeholders consisted of the Malang City Government, Mayor of Malang and Head of Disbudpar of Malang City, secondary stakeholders consisted of universities, LPPOM MUI, and the MSME sector, and the primary stakeholders consisted of the community / tourist visitors. Stakeholder collaboration itself can be explained through 7 (seven) dimensions, namely collaboration, commitment, mutuality, understanding and shared goals, trust, communication, and collaboration environment.

First, collaboration in the administration of halal tourism development that is taking into accounts the roles and responsibilities of each stakeholder, so as to realize the implementation of halal tourism in accordance with the Ministry of Tourism guidelines. The steps taken to strengthen the roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders, namely:

- a. Encourage all stakeholders related to halal tourism to understand the guidelines for holding halal tourism and play an active role in the implementation of halal tourism; and
- b. Encourage all stakeholders, especially the Regional Government to position their region or one of the provincial / regency / city tourism development areas (KPP) as halal tourism destinations, to facilitate the implementation of halal tourism, among others in terms of:
 - 1) Organizing the promotion of halal tourism;
 - 2) Conduct regular meetings to discuss opportunities and issues related to halal tourism;
 - 3) Encourage the active role of higher education halal study centers in the implementation of halal tourism.

Second, collaboration in increasing commitment is carried out to increase the success rate of the development of halal tourism. The steps taken to strengthen the commitment of all stakeholders, namely:

- a. Developing halal tourism policies as a guide in organizing halal tourism;
- b. Establishing the structure and function of the organization of halal tourism sector at the City level which has the authority to organize halal tourism;
- c. In the condition that it has not been able to form a structure that has the authority to administer halal tourism, it can form a halal tourism team with the task of implementing the implementation of halal tourism and integrating halal tourism programs and activities involving pentahelix elements.
- d. Strengthening government tourism organizations, both at the central and regional levels in the areas of destination development, marketing development, industrial development and tourism institutions, in

order to coordinate and harmonize / synergize steps in developing halal tourism;

- e. Encourage the tourism industry to use halal certified products and businesses in efforts to develop halal tourism products.

Third, mutuality will occur if each actor contributes resources, therefore other actors benefit. For example, the Mayor of Malang as a key stakeholder held seminars and technical guidance for the preparation of halal certification for hotels and restaurants in the city of Malang, and then secondary stakeholders, namely academics, called halal centers, provided laboratories to assist the legality of halal certification.

Fourth, to increase understanding and common goals, various activities such as bazaar are carried out, while academics conduct various seminars, research and technical guidance on procedural and halal tourism implementation in Malang. The steps in the implementation of research and development of halal tourism include:

- a) Increase research oriented towards developing halal tourism destinations;
- b) Increase research oriented to the development and marketing of halal tourism;
- c) Increase research oriented towards the development of the halal tourism industry; and
- d) Increase research oriented towards institutional development and human resources for halal tourism; and
- e) Encourage academics and universities to conduct research related to the implementation of halal tourism as well as the profile, needs and satisfaction of Muslim tourists for halal tourism.

Fifth, trust is a very important component in collaboration. Trust can be interpreted as an individual's belief in other individuals. Trust can affect mutuality between parties in collaboration, because the parties will be willing to cooperate with the parties they trust without any compulsion. Trust is related to the parties' confidence in themselves and others to be able to carry out their roles and responsibilities.

Sixth, communication is an important one in a collaboration. Communication serves to maintain relationships between parties in collaboration. In this study, communication is related to the sharing of information between parties. In each role and responsibility carried out by the stakeholders, there is a need for good communication for transparency in every information and receive opinions from various stakeholders, as well as negotiations in reaching agreement in the development of halal tourism in the city of Malang.

Seventh, the collaboration environment consists of a work environment. The intended work environment is the occurrence of conflict between stakeholders and the efforts made by each stakeholder to resolve any conflicts that occur in collaboration. The collaborative environment consists of the work environment and leadership style of the collaboration leader. Collaborative leaders need to have expertise in 4 (four) fields namely, 1) playing the role of a connector, 2) attracting diverse talents, 3) creating a collaboration model starting from the top, 4) analogizing an iron fist to look after the team

so as not to dwell on the debate. The following are the steps in the development of Halal Tourism HR:

- a. Identify the competency needs of halal tourism HR. Identification of the competency needs of halal tourism is pursued through mapping the conditions of the HR profile, both in the government sector and in the industrial sector at this time is associated with the prospects for the development of halal tourism in the future and its implications for the needs of halal tourism HR competencies.
- b. Provide curriculum and training modules for the development of halal tourism HR. Provision of curriculum and training modules for the development of halal tourism HR are prepared for the government and industry sectors.
- c. Conducting halal tourism HR training. After the halal tourism HR training curriculum which is equipped with training modules has been presented, the next step is to prepare an integrated tourism HR training program, which is a training program involving elements of government, industry, community, academics to the media as a single unit of halal tourism HR. Halal tourism training includes training given to HR in the government sector (central and regional) and HR in the industrial sector.

B. Supporting and Inhibiting Factors in the Development of Halal Tourism in Malang City

1. Supporting Factors

1. Internal Factor

a. Constitutional Support in Muslim Travelers

In the development of halal tourism in Malang City, which is implemented by the Malang City government and other stakeholders, in essence it has been supported by the existence of a constitution intended for Muslim tourists namely Law Number 33 of 2014 concerning Halal Product Guarantee, which in the world of tourism products this kind of thing is definitely needed by Muslim tourists, especially for food and drinks as their primary needs. Both are served in the hotel where they stay and in the restaurants available. The real aim to be achieved is the presence of a law on JPH which basically is to protect the Muslim community from avoiding anything that is contradictory to the principles of Shari'a. Furthermore, halal tourism in the perspective of RI Law No. 8 of 1999 concerning Consumer Protection, According to Article 2 of this law that, "consumer protection is based on benefits, justice, balance, security and consumer safety, and legal certainty." Legal certainty here is intended juridical protection if things don't go as what is desired by consumers, or in this case Muslim tourists in halal tourism.

b. Adequate Malang City Infrastructure

Infrastructure is a driver of economic growth. From the allocation of public and private financing, infrastructure is seen as a locomotive of national and regional development. Infrastructure is also important for improving the quality of life and human well-being, among others in increasing the value of consumption, increasing labor productivity and access to employment, as well as increasing prosperity. Infrastructure in the development of halal tourism, will depend on facilities and infrastructure that are closely related to religious activities, such as mosques / places for prayer, typical of

Islamic nuances, separate places for women and men, etc. which have a positive and safe image. Malang City has been supported by adequate infrastructure to develop halal tourism, namely the Great Mosque of Malang City, places of worship in every 500m radius or in every vehicle when the area is large. Then, for natural attractions there are also choices of separate beach and bathing attractions for men and women and / or have minimal visitor rules, and there are choices of places to eat, restaurants and cafes that are halal certified as well.

2. External Factors

a. The Increasing Rate of Halal Tourism Market Growth

The increasing number of human populations that make tourism as part of the necessities of life, and the development of technology that makes it easy for tourists to receive information about tourism, this will certainly have an impact on increasing the number of tourists both domestic and international, which will certainly impact on the tourism industry. This also happened to Muslim tourism in Malang. The increasing number of Muslim tourism originating from all over Indonesia has increased the demand market for halal products in Malang City, so it needs supporting strategic development.

b. The existence of Community Support in Malang City

The presence of halal tourism in Malang City, the fact is also supported by the people of Malang City itself. The impact of the development of halal tourism on the economy can be in general, i.e. it can be a source of community income, income for the government, employment creation, an influence on prices and tariffs, an influence on the distribution of benefits, an influence on management and ownership, and certainly can affect development.

2. Inhibiting Factors

1. Internal Factors

a. Administrative System Constraints

In relation to the development of halal tourism in Malang City, there are administrative system constraints that are related to halal labeling, where there are difficulties in halal certification, thus the use of halal centers, this also has to do with the roles and responsibilities of stakeholders in the development of halal tourism in Malang.

b. Communication Constraints

The collaborative process requires participation, equality of power, and adequate competence from stakeholders. This condition seems difficult to occur in a society that tends to have a low level of participation, equality of power, and competence (non-collaborative society), a condition of society that still occurs especially in developing countries.

Stakeholder communication is the process of exchanging messages or aspirations from development actors to influence and make decisions, if not implemented, it can hamper the process of developing halal tourism in Malang. Communication between stakeholders has continued to be developed, optimized by holding periodic meetings to make reports or evaluations of the halal tourism development program, but there are academics and MSMEs that are still not maximized in providing

reports on trends in sales of certain halal goods, thus hampering the program.

2. External Factors

a. Rejection from humanists and artists

Rejection is one form of resistance to something that is considered inappropriate to be implemented in social and state life. Rejection from humanists and artists towards the development of halal tourism in the city of Malang is due to a particular consideration where it is thought as too exclusive. Resistance from one of the elements, both because of the origin of cultural factors that are dynamic and adaptive to the new culture or because of the adjustment made by the local culture which at that time was positioned as the culture of the local community, thus exclusion in certain religions and cultures was not accepted.

b. Information Media Constraints on Halal Tourism

Information media can support the process of developing halal tourism in Malang City, because it cannot be known that the government, stakeholders and the people of Malang City have provided a tourism area that supports the sharia concept.

Media information in the process of developing halal tourism in Malang can be in the form of circulars from the City government, public notice boards, banners and billboards installed in public places, radio and local newspapers, and internet media in the form of Bappeda's website. One of the challenges in developing halal tourism is related to marketing, where in Malang itself new marketing through radio and print media, has not used local or national television media, because marketing halal tourism is not an easy thing, because of the difference between the demands of non-Muslim tourists and Muslim tourists.

CONCLUSION

Based on the explanation in the previous chapters, it can be concluded as follows:

1. The role of stakeholders in the development of halal tourism in Malang, which is divided into key stakeholders, primary and secondary (supporting) stakeholders.
2. Stakeholder collaboration in the development of halal tourism in Malang, carried out with:
 - a. Administrative collaboration with the development of halal tourism, namely paying

REFERENCES

1. Agranoff, Robert dan Michael McGuire. (2003). *Collaborative Public Management: New Strategies for Local Governments*. Whashington DC: Georgetown University Press.
2. Battour, M, dan Ismail, MN. (2016). Halal Tourism: Concepts, Practises, Challenges and Future. *Tourism Management, Perspective*. 19: 150-154.
3. Chookaew, Sureerat, Oraphan Chanin, Jirapa Charatarawat, Pingpic Sripraset, and Sudarat Nimpaya. (2015). Increasing Halal Tourism Potensial at Andaman Gulf in Thailand for Muslim Country. *Journal of Economic, Business, and Management*. 3 (7): 739-741.
4. Davis, Keith dan John W. Newstrom. 1985. Perilaku dalam Organisasi. Jakarta: Erlangga.
5. El-Ghohari, H, (2016). Halal Tourism, is it Really Halal?. *Tourism Management Perspective*. 19: 124-130.
6. Fendt, Thomas Christian. 2010. *Introducing Electronic Suplly Chain Collaboration in China: Evidence from Manufacturing Industries*. Berlin: Universitas verlag der Technischen Universitat Berlin.

attention to the roles and responsibilities of each stakeholder, so as to realize the implementation of halal tourism in accordance with the guidelines of the Ministry of Tourism.

- b. Collaboration in increasing commitment is done to increase the success rate of the development of halal tourism.
 - c. Mutuality collaboration will occur if each actor contributes resources, therefore other actors benefit.
 - d. Collaboration to increase understanding and shared goals by conducting activities such as bazaars, while academics conduct various seminars, research and technical guidance on procedural and implementation of halal tourism in Malang City.
 - e. Trust is a very important component in collaboration.
 - f. Good communication collaboration is needed for transparency in information and to receive opinions from various stakeholders.
 - g. The collaboration environment consists of work environment and leadership style.
3. Supporting and inhibiting factors in the development of halal tourism in Malang, namely internal and external factors.
 - a. Internal supporting factors, namely the constitutional support of Muslim tourists and the adequate infrastructure of Malang City.
 - b. External supporting factors, namely the increasing rate of halal tourism market and the support of the people of Malang City.
 - c. Internal inhibiting factors, namely administrative system constraints and communication constraints.
 - d. External inhibiting factors, namely the rejection of cultural figures and artists as well as the halal tourism information media constraints.

SUGGESTIONS

Based on the conclusion above, the writer can propose the following suggestions:

1. Improve and evaluate administrative systems and communication constraints on stakeholders developing halal tourism in Malang.
2. Involving humanists and artists to make halal tourism in Malang acceptable to various groups, by eliminating the impression of exclusivity.
3. Use broader halal tourism information media, such as local and national television media.

Collaboration Of Stakeholders In The Development Of Halal Tourism In Malang City Of East Java Indonesia In Technology Era 4.0

7. Freeman, R. Edward, David L. Reed. (2009). Stakeholder a New Perspektif on Corporate Governance. *California Management Review*, Vol. 25.
8. Hamdan, H., Issa, Zm., Abu, N, dan Jusoff, K. (2013). Purchasing Decisions among Muslim Consumers of Processed Halal Food Products. *Journal of Food Products Marketing*. 19 (1): 54-61.
9. Harley , James dan Blismas, Nick. 2010 An Anatomy of Collaboration Within the Online Environment. *E-Research Collaboration: Theory, Techniques and Challenges*. Heidelberg: Springer Internasional Publishing.
10. Henderson, JC. 2010. Sharia-Compliant Hotel. *Tourism and Hospitality Research*. 10 (3): 246-254.
11. Henriques dan Sardorsky. (1999). The Relationship Between Environmental Commitment and Managerial Perception of Stakeholder Importance. *Academy of Management Journal*, Vol. 42, No. 1, p. 87-99.
12. Howlett, Michael and M. Ramesh. (1995). *Studying Public Policy: Policy Cycles and Policy Subsystems*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
13. MasterCard-CrescentRating. 2019. *Global Muslim Travel Index. 2019*.
14. ODA (Overseas Development Adminstration). (1995). *Guidance Note on how to do Stakeholder Analysisi of aid Projects and Programmes*. ODA, London, UK.
15. Patsy, Healey. 1996. *Consensus-building Across Difficult Division: New Approaches to Collaborative Strategy Making*. Vol. 11, No. 2.
16. Samori, Z., Md Salleh, NZ, dan Khalid, MM. (2016). Current Trends on Halal Tourism: Cases on Selected Asian Countries. *Tourism Management Perspective*. 19: 131-136.
17. MasterCard-CrescentRating. 2019. *Global Muslim Travel Index. 2019*.
18. Miles, Mattew B dan A Michael Huberman. (2007). *Analisis Data Kualitatif, Buku Sumber Tentang Metode-Metode Baru*. Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia Press.
19. Thomson, Ann Marie dan James L. Perry. 2006. *Collaboration Processes: Inside the Black Box*. *Public Administration Review*. Hal 20-32.
20. Widagdiyo, K. (2015). Analisis Pasar Pariwisata Indonesia. *Journal of Tauhid Economics*. 1 (1): 73-80.
21. Wood, Donna J dan Barbara Gay. 1991. *Towards a Comperehensif Theory of Collaboration Journal off Applied Behavioral Sience*. Vol. 27.